<u>Recommendations for the Future Goals and Structure</u>
<u>of the</u>
<u>UNM Division for Equity & Inclusion</u>
Final Report of the DEI Task Force
Approved on December 18, 2017

Preamble:

The University of New Mexico is the flagship university of one of the most diverse states in the union. We acknowledge with respect that the University stands upon the traditional territory of Tiwa-speaking peoples, including the Pueblos of Sandia and Isleta, whose historical relationship with these lands continues to this day. UNM carries the responsibility to incorporate the state's diversity and reflect the value of inclusion so central to higher education today.[1] In doing so, it will help redress the state's and the nation's legacies of exclusion and inequality. In September 2017, this task force was constituted by UNM President Chaouki Abdallah to recommend the goals and structure for equity and inclusion that would best enable the university to meet this responsibility.

The land that now makes up New Mexico has been home to Indigenous peoples for millennia, and over recent centuries has diversified with the arrival of a wide variety of other cultural communities. The University of New Mexico is the only research-intensive and minority-serving flagship university in the United States. In this regard, UNM already represents what research-intensive U.S. universities will look like in the future. *We are thus uniquely positioned to innovate in ways that will define and drive the future of public higher education in this country*. Others, including the major federal funding agencies and major foundations, recognize this potential and are betting on us by investing in UNM's infrastructure and mission. As a result, we continue to benefit materially from this identification. Fully embracing this leadership role can only increase those investments in our students and our academic mission—and allow us to carve out new national prominence as the flagship public university truly delivering *both* excellence in research and equity for the nation's diverse communities. Too long have excellence and equity been pitted against each other. This report envisions *excellence-and-equity* as the heart of a more dynamic University of New Mexico.

As UNM fully embraces this transformation, our diversity will offer a powerful strategic path towards excellence. Within the pool of excellent scholars and researchers nationally, there are those who would want to join us in preference to other richer and more renowned universities. Embodying a commitment to equity, diversity, and excellence in all facets of our work can become UNM's moral center and strategic advantage, attracting those who care about the equity-diversity-excellence nexus. UNM has often succeeded when we have truly committed on this terrain, and it represents our most promising path to national prominence in the future.

---

[1] URL links to trend data for UNM students, staff, and faculty are appended at the end of this document.

Therefore, the central mandate for the re-organized structure envisioned by this task force is to advocate for and help lead the transformation of the University of New Mexico into an institution that embodies the values and practices that New Mexico needs now—and which will be urgently needed in the diverse American university of the future.

Goals of the Re-Organized Division of Equity & Inclusion:[2]

Two overarching goals will drive the future work of the re-organized DEI structure:
   A. Designing and advocating for the steps, structures, and resources necessary to more assertively advance equity, excellence, and inclusion at all levels of the tenure-track faculty and in central administration; while simultaneously
   B. Consolidating recent progress on diversity, equity, and inclusion at the student and staff levels, and continuing to advance that work on all fronts in order to make it a permanent part of UNM's culture, structure, and self-understanding.

Dynamic DEI leaders should be catalysts, advocates, and educators on both fronts. The re-organized DEI structure will draw both on past recommendations from within UNM and on the best models for equity and inclusion at research universities around the country. The ultimate goal can be articulated in terms of excellence-and-equity, inclusive excellence, or transformational excellence; the common denominator is a university dedicated systematically to linking academic excellence and equity across diversity in ways that transform the entire enterprise. In pursuing these goals, UNM should:

   1.   Create an inclusive and equitable campus climate:
        a. identify and provide formal role for thoughtful diversity champions in staff, faculty, student and administrative leadership ranks, to advocate and educate on campus climate issues in their respective areas;
        b. assure full programmatic access for individuals from all backgrounds capable of succeeding in them;
        c. develop diversity performance goals for the University as a whole and for each College;
        d. create appropriate metrics for assessing those goals over time;
        e. implement consistent, regular climate surveys to benchmark and monitor progress toward those goals;
        f. create incentives for the constant pursuit and achievement of equity and excellence in the academic mission, both in academic units and support services;
        g. provide high-quality training on implicit bias, bias response, bystander intervention, hate incident response, etc.

   2.   Constantly locate UNM at the intersection of: i) commitment to equity & inclusion; ii) excellence in the academic mission of the flagship research university in a diverse

---

[2] A new name may be appropriate for the re-organized unit, better reflecting its mandate for advancing excellence-and-equity across the entire university. Terms such as inclusive excellence, collective impact, innovation, and transformational excellence might inform such a new name. Whether "Division" is the best organizational term also remains to be determined. Both questions presumably fall under the purview of incoming President Garnett S. Stokes. For convenience and understanding, we here refer to the new structure as "DEI" but do not assume that name will remain.

state and nation; and iii) regularly assessing our progress in pursuing the overlap and interdependence of equity & excellence

3. Recruit, retain, professionally develop, and promote a diverse faculty, staff, and central administration; and recruit undergraduate and graduate students from diverse social backgrounds and retain them to successful degree completion

4. Nurture a university culture in which students of all backgrounds and interests can thrive because they are supported personally, challenged to develop intellectually, and invited to grow holistically

5. Support and recognize innovative and inclusive scholarship, teaching, mentoring, and creative work that engages local communities and contributes to improving the quality of life in New Mexico

6. Formulate long-term goals for equity and inclusion that advance UNM's commitment to excellence as a public research university, planning to meet those goals, and holding ourselves accountable for doing so. Planning should define measurable goals and institutionalize structures and practices to buttress UNM's overall commitment and deepen unit-level responsibility on this terrain

7. Avoid duplication of efforts elsewhere in the university and the budgetary inefficiencies that result; the focus should fall on dynamic collaboration and leadership rather than retail programming that distracts from that focus

Principles of Excellence Guiding Research, Scholarship, and Teaching at UNM:

The re-organized DEI structure will advocate for research, knowledge production, patient care, and creative work at UNM that:

- Affirms and reflects strong scholarly standards set out by disciplines and interdisciplinary fields
- Encourages robust discussion among specialists across disciplines and interdisciplinary fields in order to stimulate new vantage points and perspectives responsive to complex problems; such dialogue should locate the university community at the emerging edge of human knowledge
- Advances work that expands human understanding of the natural world and society; builds meaning and solidarity within and across human communities; and improves quality of life, health and well-being, educational achievement, and civic engagement in diverse communities
- Engages students and the broader community in reflecting on what constitutes social justice; and supports them in working for social transformation in that direction, both within and beyond the academy
- Supports the development of intercultural understanding and critical consciousness about the world so that faculty and students can become problem solvers in diverse living and working environments
- Is disseminated via excellent peer-reviewed publications and programs as well as in diverse venues intended for broad and diverse audiences

DEI's Current Situation:

DEI does not exist in isolation, but is nested within a University structure facing new opportunities and significant challenges. While a detailed discussion of that is beyond our purposes, we highlight a few UNM-wide opportunities and challenges here that most affect DEI. The opportunities include UNM's remarkable positioning to help meet the needs of American society as social diversity continues to grow; the desire of federal agencies and major national and local foundations to fund efforts to meet those needs; the coming new leadership under President Garnett Stokes; the continuing re-design of UNM's structures and processes; and the chance to better capitalize on longstanding work for equity & inclusion and for academic excellence within the university. The challenges include ongoing declines in state funding, falling numbers of traditional-age college students (and thus tuition dollars), and a political climate that doubts the value of public institutions and higher education despite evidence supporting the centrality of both to economic prosperity and political democracy.

The above challenges mean that UNM is at risk of the fate that appears in store for many mid-tier flagship public universities in the United States, at least those that fail to innovate to confront the challenges: a slow decline into mediocrity as public funding and support dry up. But the above opportunities mean that UNM can escape that fate—if we innovate not in generic ways that simply place us in competition with better-funded institutions elsewhere, but boldly and in ways that reflect the strengths, gifts, and needs of New Mexico and UNM. A central part of the required innovation will be pursuing equity-and-excellence simultaneously and vigorously and at all levels of university life.

DEI currently draws on approximately $1.1 million/year in funding, 70% of which comes from I&G sources (the core university budget). About 80% of the overall budget goes to personnel costs (30% directly for bridge funding for faculty hiring to support diversity; 50% to internal staffing). The rest of the budget goes primarily toward travel, food, and in-house programming in support of equity and inclusion at UNM. These expenditures have built constituencies and sustained advocacy for equity and inclusion across a variety of UNM settings, particularly vis-à-vis student life and the staff; they have been less successful in assertively advancing excellence, equity, and inclusion in tenure-track faculty hiring-and-promotion processes and within the central administration. A newly empowered DEI structure must do the latter more successfully while continuing to advocate for and advance equity and inclusion in all facets of student life and within the UNM staff. Future University allocations and DEI budgets should reflect these priorities.[3]

Creating and Empowering the New Organizational Structure:

DEI's future hallmarks must be dynamism and shared endeavor for organizational transformation that places equity-**and**-excellence at the heart of our mission. Doing so successfully will require DEI to become a center of collaboration that drives visionary change

---

[3] Given that one way UNM draws external funding is by invoking our demographic diversity and commitment to equity, the DEI budget should include a portion of F&A flows from external funding and the DEI head should have a collaborative voice in F&A allocation discussions.

across the University, bringing together current champions and future allies in a shared project. That shared project must be supported by university leaders and must *catalyze* rather than substitute for efforts driven by academic, student support, and administrative units. We use the word "catalyze" very intentionally: in chemistry, a catalyst facilitates and drives processes forward, but is not used up in the process. DEI must play this kind of dynamic and catalytic role while using its fiscal and human resources carefully to drive organizational change.

But what kind of project should be front-and-center in DEI's work? The only such shared project that can draw widespread support within and beyond the University will link two commitments: i) valuing equity and inclusion across contrasting social backgrounds, in order to become the pipeline of the diverse future leaders needed by U.S. and global society; and ii) committing to excellence in the academic mission in ways specific to UNM's status as a flagship public *research* university. UNM must build an organizational culture that sees these as interdependent and mutually sustaining, consistently refusing to compromise either.

In turn, achieving the internal dynamism needed to catalyze that shared project will require three kinds of transformations within DEI:

- *Constantly focusing on the core mission*: In order to fulfill its core mission of catalyzing organizational change throughout UNM, DEI must be accepted as a partner and collaborator broadly across the working units of the university. Such collaboration should draw on current diversity champions and recruit new allies who embrace the centrality and urgency of the equity-and-excellence project. Existing champions and new allies can then advocate for this project within their units, and educate their colleagues on how the linkage of equity and excellence can transform research, teaching, and service in their unit by generating new focus and new resources for the academic mission.
- Using DEI's fiscal resources and personnel in ways that maximize impact *on the day-to-day practices within academic units* and the classroom (and expanding those resources as DEI proves its ability to advance excellence and equity in the academic mission).
- Moving most program provision to supportive units elsewhere in the University (but with ongoing "dotted-line" accountability to DEI), to allow DEI leadership to focus on its core mission and to impact day-to-day academic practices.

The above-defined goals and internal changes will best position DEI to contribute to the transformational changes required for UNM to become all that it needs to be for the residents of New Mexico and for its own students, staff, and faculty. But further changes beyond DEI's internal goals and structure must likewise be in place if institutional transformation for excellence-and-equity is to succeed. Among these larger-scale changes the following stand out:

1. *Empowered position within UNM's overall organizational structure:*
   To succeed in catalyzing efforts at institutional transformation, DEI leadership must have the capacity to intersect regularly with highest-level university leaders. This organizational positioning allows the DEI head to be an agent of transformation by advising strategic decision-making on a day-to-day basis and helping university leaders

to constantly articulate overall institutional directions and priorities in light of the shared project. The overall head of DEI should therefore report directly to the UNM President and be a routine participant in deliberations within Academic Affairs, the Health Sciences Center, and administrative matters, including a 'dotted line' relationship with the Provost, Chancellor, and VP for Administration.[4]

This reporting structure will generate the kind of "upward accountability" needed to assure that DEI adheres to overall university mission and priorities and utilizes its resources efficiently and in keeping with the academic mission. This should include internal DEI administrative processes that assure no repeat of oversight failures that occurred in recent years (see the 2017 Internal Audit report for details).

In order to effectively advance the equity-and-excellence project, the overall head of the Division of Equity & Inclusion must be able to credibly represent this shared project to academic and support units at all levels of the University and on all campuses. In particular, efficacy within the research university structure requires that the DEI head be able to draw respect from faculty leaders across disciplines. Thus, s/he should be a tenured member of the faculty (or eligible for tenured appointment) with a strong research profile *and* hold an established track record of advocating for and advancing equity initiatives in higher education. S/he should also enjoy all rights of academic freedom to publish and advocate on issues of equity, inclusion, diversity, and academic excellence. Beneath the overall head, chief diversity officers (or similar title; typically tenured, clinical, or research faculty members compensated via SACs, or highly accomplished staff members) should oversee equity and inclusion initiatives in particular segments of the University.

2. *Associated structure of advocates and change agents within each College/School and within all student support and administrative units*:

The central DEI structure described above would be too lean to truly catalyze equity-and-excellence at the unit level. To do so, it must draw on credible allies within each College and School, as well as within each large-scale student support and administrative unit. Leaders of each of these key structures will be asked to identify an equity-and-excellence champion from within its own staff or faculty; these positions should be appointed at the associate dean or similar level and compensated appropriately either as part of the

---

[4] Under this model, one potential division of labor would have chief diversity officers for north campus; main campus and athletics; and branch campuses. An alternative overall structure would have a Chief Diversity Officer or VP for Equity & Inclusion on main campus and a Vice Chancellor for Equity & Inclusion on north campus, both reporting jointly: i) to the UNM President; and ii) to the Provost and Chancellor, respectively. Under this structure, excellence and equity at the branch campuses could fall under the purview of the existing Branch Liaison role. The right model obviously falls under the discretion of the UNM President.

person's regular job duties (with reductions elsewhere) or via additional compensation (SACs or other).

These College/School/unit advocates should be chosen for their dynamism in advocating for diversity, equity, excellence, and inclusion as core values within UNM's academic mission; and for their credibility vis-à-vis colleagues who can help steer this shared project to success at the unit level. Their mandate must be broad enough to allow them to offer coaching and advice regarding issues of recruitment, hiring, promotion, retention, and campus climate among students, staff, and faculty within their unit and in consultation with the Dean or unit head. These advocates will report directly to the Dean/head of the unit, with 'dotted line' accountability to the head of DEI (which could be delegated to the appropriate chief diversity officer).

These advocates will collaborate with the central DEI staff to identify systemic barriers to diversity, excellence, equity, and inclusion within UNM; and to create levers for change in UNM's organizational culture in order to overcome those barriers. This work will build on past work by DEI, other university-wide advocacy structures, and unit-level diversity champions throughout the university, but do so in ways empowered across all units and coordinated with the overall drive for excellence in the academic mission.

To achieve the dynamic leadership required to drive equity-and-excellence throughout the university, these advocates will need to build a collaborative work process vis-à-vis one another, their Deans/unit heads, and the central DEI staff. This, in turn, will generate the "downward accountability" necessary for DEI staff to stay grounded in the day-to-day work of units at the front line of the academic mission.

3. *Allies and critical external reviewers from excellent public research universities nationwide:*

To succeed in positioning UNM at the forefront of equity and inclusion work nationally, this effort must also be held accountable to national best practices regarding equity and inclusion and to research university standards of academic excellence. To assure this, UNM should: i) set up a national advisory board of eminent leaders on equity and inclusion at research universities, federal funding agencies, and major foundations to advise UNM leaders and the head of DEI; and ii) institutionalize an equity-and-excellence national peer review board, with a process parallel to the Academic Program Review undergone every seven to ten years by each academic department. Members of the national advisory board might be ideal external reviewers for the equity-and-excellence national review. Ultimately, such reviews might occur on the standard seven-year cycle, but initially they should occur more frequently, perhaps every two or three years.

This structure will generate the "outward accountability" that holds UNM to best national standards of academic research, teaching, and service and inclusive excellence.

The above changes should result in three clear changes from the past:

- First, DEI will be more focused on its core mission, and prioritize its budget accordingly
- Second, that mission will be clearer to all: Advancing excellence-and-equity across all dimensions of the academic mission, in ways that reflect UNM's status as the flagship research university in a diverse state
- Third, that mission will draw on authority, expertise, and commitment from within academic departments and colleges, from top institutional leaders, and from beyond the university—with DEI serving as a catalyst to advance excellence and equity via collaborative and coaching relationships in all those settings

Just as a tree thrives by drawing sustenance and energy from above and below ground, the university's commitment to excellence-and-equity will best thrive if the new DEI structure can draw on vigorous contributions from many partners, both in university leadership and in academic and support units, including those who have championed diversity up to now *and* those who newly embrace this opportunity.

Conclusion: Making UNM a National Leader

Easy language invoking excellence, equity, and institutional transformation will not make UNM what it needs to be for the future. Excellent work on this terrain happens every day at UNM, but not nearly systematically enough. Whether the goal is articulated as excellence-and-equity, inclusive excellence, transformational excellence, or some other term matters less than the hard work to drive daily decisions and practices *simultaneously* toward excellence in the academic mission and toward equity & inclusion for the nation's diverse communities. That combination represents UNM's best roadmap to national prominence *and* to redeeming its ethical obligations to the residents of New Mexico.

We do not offer a detailed blueprint for the path ahead; that blueprint should be the work of the new head of DEI. But clearly, getting excellence-and-equity right *systematically* will require a variety of partial steps, including:

- Sustained organizational discipline to focus on the core DEI mission as defined above
- Small-scale testing of pilot projects on how best to link excellence and equity in innovative and effective ways—followed by systematic, university-wide implementation of those found to be most effective
- In the creation of both pilot and large-scale systems for equity-and-excellence, utilizing "design thinking" *from the point of view of students, staff, and faculty* rather than bureaucratically; that is, designing with the end users of teaching, research and creative work, patient care, and advising in mind

- Not command-and-control systems but rather coaching and collaboration vis-à-vis all levels of the university, including executives but also chairs, deans, directors, search committee chairs, and other institutional leaders
- No part of UNM should be immune from the requirements of excellence and equity, including structures of faculty governance, student governance, tenure-and-promotion, and staff advancement. Training against implicit bias should be required for leadership positions at all levels, including faculty search committees; and contributions to the equity-and-excellence agenda should be an element of annual reviews. Increasingly, appropriate skills and a demonstrated track record of work for equity/inclusion/excellence should also be a requirement for all university leadership positions

The watchwords for this dynamic, sustained effort should be transparency and accountability, with everyone involved held to high standards of excellence and commitment to equity. Succeeding in the effort will involve both drawing on and re-shaping the core skill sets of *everyone* in the institution. We will all need to learn new competencies at the overlap of equity and excellence; we will all need to incorporate new practices into our work routines. Given the challenges and opportunities of this endeavor, we urge UNM to implement this newly empowered structure immediately but deliberatively. We should not expect perfection from ourselves or others as we work together across cultural boundaries to advance equity and excellence at UNM, but we should all strive for the humility to learn anew on this terrain. On that path lies UNM's best future.

Members of the DEI Task Force:

Pamela Agoyo	American Indian Student Services
Yemane Asmerom	Earth and Planetary Sciences
Charles Becknell	Africana Studies
Amanda Butrum	Accessibility Resource Center
Gregory Cajete	Native American Studies
Rosa Isela Cervantes	El Centro de la Raza
Francie Cordova	Office of Equal Opportunity
Christine Zuni Cruz	School of Law
Leila Flores-Duenas	Teacher Education/Educational Leadership/Policy
Geraldine Forbes	School of Architecture & Planning
Felipe Gonzales	Sociology and ADVANCE-UNM initiative
Meriah Heredia-Griego	Center for Education Policy Research
Jessica Hidalgo Holland	Women's Resource Center
Nancy Lopez	Sociology
Glenabah Martinez	LLSS, College of Education
Brenda Pereda	UNM School of Medicine
Kymberly Pinder	College of Fine Arts
Kathy Powers	Political Science
Adriana Ramirez de Arellano	Women's Studies
Sonia Gipson Rankin	University College and Africana Studies
Mario Rivera	Public Administration
Barbara Rodriguez	Speech and Hearing Sciences
Felisha Rohan-Minares	UNM School of Medicine
Jane Ellen Smith	Psychology
Julia So	UNM-Valencia
Brandi Stone	African American Student Services
Nasha Torrez	Dean of Students
Chantel Trujillo	ENLACE
Claudia X. Valdes	College of Fine Arts, Department of Art
Irene Vasquez	Chicana/o Studies Department
Richard L. Wood, Chair	Senior Vice Provost

Additional Resources:

A series of extremely useful data dashboards from UNM Office of Institutional Analytics, with data on demographics for students, staff, and faculty. The student dashboards cover 1996-2016, and the faculty/staff dashboards cover 2002-2016.

Graduate Students by Gender
https://public.tableau.com/profile/unm.oia#!/vizhome/GraduateStudentsbyGender/GraduateStudentsbyGender

Graduate Students by Ethnicity
https://public.tableau.com/views/GraduateStudentsbyEthnicity/GraduateStudentsbyEthnicity?:embed=y&:display_count=yes

UG Students by Gender
https://public.tableau.com/views/UGStudentsbyGender/UndergraduateStudentsbyGender?:embed=y&:display_count=yes

UG Students by Ethnicity
https://public.tableau.com/views/UGStudentsbyEthnicity/UndergraduateStudentsbyEthnicity?:embed=y&:display_count=yes

Faculty by Gender
https://public.tableau.com/views/FacultybyGender/FacultyByGender?:embed=y&:display_count=yes&publish=yes

Faculty by Ethnicity
https://public.tableau.com/profile/unm.oia#!/vizhome/FacultybyEthnicity/FacultybyRace

Staff by Gender
https://public.tableau.com/views/FacultybyGender/FacultyByGender?:embed=y&:display_count=yes&publish=yes

Staff by Ethnicity
https://public.tableau.com/views/StaffbyEthnicity/StaffbyEthnicity?:embed=y&:display_count=yes

Useful documents from past work at UNM at diverse.unm.edu, including:

2013 Diversity Council Framework for Strategic Action Report
http://diverse.unm.edu/about-dei/diversity-council/diversity-council-final-report-diversity-council-framework-for-strategic-action-01282013.pdf